



**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**

Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street, Suite 800  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
415.778.6700  
[www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov)

## **Air Quality Conformity Task Force**

Metropolitan Transportation Commission  
Bay Area Metro Center

### **Mount Hamilton Conference Room**

375 Beale Street, Suite 800

(Note: Visitors must check in with the receptionist on the 7th floor)  
San Francisco, CA

Conference Call Number: Dial - **(415) 655-0002 (Access Code: 927 500 657)**

Participant ID is # **button.**)

**Thursday, March 28, 2019**

**9:30 a.m. –11:00 a.m.**

## **AGENDA**

1. Welcome and Introductions
2. PM<sub>2.5</sub> Project Conformity Interagency Consultations
  - a. Confirm Projects Are Exempt from PM<sub>2.5</sub> Conformity
    - i. Projects Exempt Under 40 CFR 93.126 – Not of Air Quality Concern
3. Projects with Regional Air Quality Conformity Concerns
  - a. Review of the Regional Conformity Status for New and Revised Projects
    - 3a\_Regional\_AQ\_Conformity\_Review\_012419.pdf
    - 3\_Attachment-A\_List\_of\_Proposed\_New\_Projects\_12419.pdf
4. Transportation Air Quality Conformity Redetermination for the 2019 Transportation Improvement Program and Amended Plan Bay Area 2040
5. Consent Calendar
  - a. February 28, 2019 Air Quality Conformity Task Force Meeting Summary
6. Other Items
  - a. Revocation of California's Clean Air Act's (CAA) Waiver (Update)

Next Meeting: April 25, 2019

MTC Staff Liaison: Harold Brazil [hbrazil@bayareametro.gov](mailto:hbrazil@bayareametro.gov)



METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION

Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
TEL 415.778.6700  
WEB [www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov)

## *Memorandum*

TO: Air Quality Conformity Task Force

DATE: March 15, 2019

FR: Harold Brazil

W. I.

RE: PM<sub>2.5</sub> Project Conformity Interagency Consultation

MTC requests the review and concurrence from the Air Quality Conformity Task Force (AQCTF) that the list of projects sponsors have identified as exempt and likely not to be a POAQC. **2b\_Exempt List 03142019.pdf** lists exempt projects under 40 CFR 93.126.

40 CFR 93.126 Exempt Projects List

County	TIP ID	Sponsor	Project Name	Project Description	Expanded Description	Project Type under 40 CFR 93.126
ALA	ALA190007	Oakland	Foothill Blvd & MacArthur Blvd Pedestrian Safety	Oakland: On Foothill Blvd from Harrington Ave to Cole St, and MacArthur Blvd from 69th to 96th Ave: H9-04-021 Construct bulbouts, pedestrian median refuge islands, crosswalk enhancements, Rectangular Rapid Flashing Beacons (RRFBS), signs and striping	Oakland: On Foothill Blvd from Harrington Ave to Cole St, and MacArthur Blvd from 69th to 96th Ave: H9-04-021 Construct bulbouts, pedestrian median refuge islands, crosswalk enhancements, Rectangular Rapid Flashing Beacons (RRFBS), signs and striping	Air Quality - Bicycle and pedestrian facilities
ALA	ALA190008	Oakland	Oakland - Various Intersection Imprvmnts H9-04-022	Oakland: On 7th St and Filbert St, Oakland Ave and Moss Ave, and 98th Ave and C St: H9-04-022 Pedestrian improvements on 4 uncontrolled crosswalks along minor arterials at 3 intersections.	Oakland: On 7th St and Filbert St, Oakland Ave and Moss Ave, and 98th Ave and C St: H9-04-022 Pedestrian improvements on 4 uncontrolled crosswalks along minor arterials at 3 intersections. Improvements include flashing beacons, pavement markings, signage, median island, curb ramps, and bulb outs. Funding is from set-aside for pedestrian safety, countermeasures not required.	Air Quality - Bicycle and pedestrian facilities
ALA	ALA190009	Alameda County	H9-04-004 Tesla Road Safety Improvements	Alameda County: At 10 locations along Tesla Road between Eagles Run Rd and McLaughlin Rd: H9-04-004 Guardrail upgrades to address guardrail height and damaged guardrails. Set Aside for Guardrails Upgrade.	Alameda County: At 10 locations along Tesla Road between Eagles Run Rd and McLaughlin Rd: H9-04-004 Guardrail upgrades to address guardrail height and damaged guardrails. Set Aside for Guardrails Upgrade.	Safety - Guardrails, median barriers, crash cushions
ALA	ALA190010	Alameda County	H9-04-003 Alameda County Rural Roads Safety Imps	Alameda County: Various rural roads include Crow Canyon Rd, Palomares Rd, North Vasco Rd, and Altamont Pass Rd: H9-04-003 Improve shoulders, edgeline rumble strips, signs and delineators.	Alameda County: Various rural roads include Crow Canyon Rd, Palomares Rd, North Vasco Rd, and Altamont Pass Rd: H9-04-003 Improve shoulders, edgeline rumble strips, signs and delineators.	Safety - Shoulder improvements
ALA	ALA190011	Alameda County	Alameda Co Unsignalized Intersection Imps H9-04-001	Alameda County: Various roadways: H9-04-001 Add Intersection lighting, Install/Upgrade stop signs, intersection warning signs, pedestrian crossings. Countermeasures: NS1, NS5, and NS18.	Alameda County: Various roadways: H9-04-001 Add Intersection lighting, Install/Upgrade stop signs, intersection warning signs, pedestrian crossings. Countermeasures: NS1, NS5, and NS18.	Safety - Lighting improvements
ALA	ALA190012	Alameda County	Alameda Co-Signalized Intersection Imps H9-04-002	Alameda County: Various Intersections: H9-04-002 Install Mast arms, signal hardware, reflective plates, implement leading pedestrian interval (LPI). Countermeasures: S2, S7, and S22.	Alameda County: Various Intersections: H9-04-002 Install Mast arms, signal hardware, reflective plates, implement leading pedestrian interval (LPI). Countermeasures: S2, S7, and S22.	Safety - Safety improvement program
CC	CC-190003	CC County	H9-04-009 Kirker Pass Road Safety Improvements	Contra Costa County: At two intersections: H9-04-009 Install intersection lighting, protective guardrail along the top of embankment, and delineators/reflectors along the K-rail median.	Contra Costa County: At the two Hess Rd intersections: H9-04-009 Install intersection lighting; Between City of Concord and approximately Nortonville Rd: Install protective guardrail along the top of embankment and install delineators/reflectors along the K-rail median.	Safety - Guardrails, median barriers, crash cushions
CC	CC-190004	CC County	H9-04-010 Crockett Area Guardrail Upgrades	Contra Costa County: Various guardrails in the Crockett area: H9-04-010 Upgrade sub-standard MBGR guardrails to Caltrans standard MGS guardrails and end treatments on arterials and major collector roadways (approx 41 guardrails of over 12,000ft).	Contra Costa County: Various guardrails in the Crockett area: H9-04-010 Upgrade sub-standard MBGR guardrails to Caltrans standard MGS guardrails and end treatments on arterials and major collector roadways (approximately 41 guardrails with a length of over 12,000ft including end treatments).	Safety - Guardrails, median barriers, crash cushions
CC	CC-190005	Pittsburg	Pittsburgh H9-04-025 Traffic Signal Improvements	Pittsburg: At 62 intersections throughout the City: H9-04-025 Traffic signal improvements	Pittsburg: At 62 intersections throughout the City: H9-04-025 Traffic signal improvements including improved signal hardware (signal heads, pedestrian heads, push buttons, visors, backplates, controllers, cabinets, battery backup systems, UPS, and modems) and improved signal timing	Safety - Safety improvement program
CC	CC-190006	Concord	Concord Citywide Traffic System Update (H9-04-008)	Concord: At various traffic signal interchanges in the City: H9-04-008 Improve signal hardware, upgrade cabinet equipment, controllers and modify phasing to provide a Lead Pedestrian Interval (LPI).	Concord: At various traffic signal interchanges in the City: H9-04-008 Improve signal hardware (lenses, backplates, mountings, size, number), upgrade cabinet equipment, controllers and modify phasing to provide a Lead Pedestrian Interval (LPI).	Safety - Safety improvement program
MRN	MRN190007	Marin County	Marin Co-Upgrade Non-Standard Guardrails H9-04-017	Marin County: Various rural arterials and major collector roadways: H9-04-017 Upgrade nonstandard guardrails	Marin County: Various rural arterials and major collector roadways: H9-04-017 Replace nonstandard guardrails that have nonstandard end treatments and lower than minimum guardrail height required. The guardrails are located in Marin County along high volume and speed rural arterial and collectors roadways.	Safety - Guardrails, median barriers, crash cushions
MRN	MRN190008	Marin County	Countywide Signal Upgrade Project (HSIP9-04-016)	Marin County: At 51 signalized intersections throughout the county and its cities and towns: H9-04-016 Install pedestrian countdown heads, pedestrian push buttons, 12" LED signal heads, signal head backplates and advanced dilemma zone detections	Marin County: At 51 signalized intersections throughout the county and its cities and towns: H9-04-016 Install pedestrian countdown heads, pedestrian push buttons, 12" LED signal heads, signal head backplates and advanced dilemma zone detections. The Project was identified through the analysis conducted as a part of the Marin County Systemic Safety Analysis Report (SSAR). The Marin SSAR is a data-driven approach to analyzing collisions county wide to identify locations with the highest collisions, potential improvements and underlying factors contributing to collisions. As part of this analysis, a systemic safety approach was taken; this analysis identified locations on Marin's arterial and collector roads that have a high potential for collisions, based on historic crash patterns and identified predictors of crashes. The analysis found that, across the intersections evaluated, the presence of signals at intersections are a significant predictor of elevated crash rates. This runs counter to expected crash reduction benefits associated with signals. An investigation at these high collision locations revealed that many signals throughout Marin County have substandard hardware and lack 12" LED signal heads, backplates, pedestrian countdown heads, APS push buttons and advanced detection loops. The Project will install these improvements at the intersections with the highest instances of collisions in Marin County as well as intersections that have the same features as high collision locations. In total, at the 51 locations identified, there have been 431 reported collisions in the past five years, including 41 killed or severely injured (KSI) collisions, 61 pedestrian collisions and 48 bicycle collisions. Of the 431 reported collisions, 98 of the collision's main traffic violation was a motorist disregarding a signal, 33 involved a motorist failing to yield to a pedestrian, and 121 were traveling too fast for the conditions.	Safety - Safety improvement program
MRN	MRN190009	San Rafael	H9-04-030 Third Street Safety Improvements Project	San Rafael: Third Street at the signalized intersections of Lindaro, Lincoln, Tamalpais, Irwin, and Grand: H9-04-030 Install high-visibility crosswalks, advanced stop bars, pedestrian countdown signals and new traffic signal mast arm poles.	San Rafael: Third Street at the signalized intersections of Lindaro, Lincoln, Tamalpais, Irwin, and Grand: H9-04-030 Install high-visibility crosswalks, advanced stop bars, pedestrian countdown signals and new traffic signal mast arm poles.	Safety - Safety improvement program
MRN	MRN190010	Novato	Novato Traffic, Bicycle & Pedestrian Improvements	Novato: Along the Diablo Ave/De Long Ave corridor between Novato Blvd and Reichert Ave: H9-09-020 Enhance pedestrian and traffic safety	Novato: Along the Diablo Ave/De Long Ave corridor between Novato Blvd and Reichert Ave: H9-09-020 Enhance pedestrian and traffic safety by improving pedestrian crosswalks throughout the corridor, installing advanced dilemma zone detection at two key intersections, and providing an advance flashing beacon upstream of an intersection with an arterial roadway	Air Quality - Bicycle and pedestrian facilities
NAP	NAP170005	Saint Helena	Main Street St. Helena Pedestrian Improvements	Saint Helena: Along Main Street (SR29) from Mitchell Dr to Pine St: Replace and upgrade pedestrian facilities and install traffic calming devices	Saint Helena: Along Main Street (SR29) from Mitchell Dr to Pine St: Replace and upgrade pedestrian facilities and install traffic calming devices. The project will include the removal and replacement of approximately 3,609 linear feet of sidewalk, 17 curb ramps, construct pedestrian bulb outs, crosswalk enhancements, tree removal and replacement, landscape irrigation, sewer and water lateral replacement, and installation of street light electrical	Air Quality - Bicycle and pedestrian facilities

40 CFR 93.126 Exempt Projects List

County	TIP ID	Sponsor	Project Name	Project Description	Expanded Description	Project Type under 40 CFR 93.126
NAP	NAP190002	Saint Helena	Silverado Trail Guardrail Replacement H9-04-032	St Helena: On Silverado Trail from approximately 175 feet north of Howell Mountain Road and ending at the southern City limits: H9-04-032 Replace approximately 1,175 lineal feet of existing guardrail and replace striping and pavement markings	St Helena: On Silverado Trail from approximately 175 feet north of Howell Mountain Road and ending at the southern City limits: H9-04-032 Design, construction management, traffic control, and removal of approximately 1,175 lineal feet of existing guardrail and wood posts to be replaced with new steel posts, new metal guardrail beams and guardrail delineators as well as upgrade all existing striping and pavement markings on Silverado Trail within the City limits. CM=S4	Safety - Safety improvement program
SCL	SCL190018	Cupertino	Preventative Maintenance on 5 Bridges in Cupertino	Cupertino: 5 bridges in city: PM00132 Preventative maintenance	Cupertino: 1) Stevens Crk Blvd over Calabasas Crk 37C0012, 2) Homestead Rd over Stevens Crk 37C0017, 3) McClellan Rd over Stevens Crk 37C0220, 4) Tantau Av over Calabasas Crk 37C0290, 5) Miller Av over Calabasas Crk 37C0431: Preventative maintenance and repairs on these bridges:	Safety - Hazard elimination program
SCL	SCL190020	San Jose	H9-04-027 Monterey Road - HSIP Guardrail Upgrade	San Jose: Monterey Road between Skyway Drive and Palm Avenue: H9-04-027 Upgrade guardrails that are damaged and not up to current standards	San Jose: Monterey Road between Skyway Drive and Palm Avenue: H9-04-027 Upgrade guardrails that are damaged and not up to current standards	Safety - Guardrails, median barriers, crash cushions
SCL	SCL190021	Los Gatos	H9-04-015 Los Gatos Guardrail Upgrades	Los Gatos: On Blossom Hill Rd, Cleland Ave, Los Gatos Blvd, Miles Ave, More Ave, Reservoir Rd, and Santa Rosa Dr: H9-04-015 Upgrade the existing non-conforming and/or damaged guardrails	Los Gatos: On Blossom Hill Rd, Cleland Ave, Los Gatos Blvd, Miles Ave, More Ave, Reservoir Rd, and Santa Rosa Dr: H9-04-015 Upgrade the existing non-conforming and/or damaged guardrails	Safety - Guardrails, median barriers, crash cushions
SM	SM-190005	Brisbane	Guadalupe Canyon Pkwy Safety Improvements	Brisbane: On Guadalupe Canyon Pkwy between western city limit and Bayshore Blvd: H9-04-007 restripe roadway to include class 2 bike lanes and add safety countermeasures	Brisbane: On Guadalupe Canyon Pkwy between western city limit and Bayshore Blvd: H9-04-007 Restripe roadway to include class 2 bike lanes and add safety countermeasures. Install edgeline rumble stripes, bike lane markings, and bike lane signage along shoulders. Restripe lane and centerline markings to create median, and install centerline rumble stripes. Upgrade existing flashing beacons with solar-powered LED flashing warning signs.	Safety - Shoulder improvements
SOL	SOL190005	Vacaville	H9-04-036 Vacaville Ped Crossing Enhancements	Vacaville: At Browns Valley Rd and Waterford/Clarecastle Way, and Marshall Rd and Southside Bikeway: H9-04-036 Implement ped crossing enhancements, advanced ped warning signs, Rectangular Rapid Flashing Beacons (RRFBs), high visibility crosswalk striping	Vacaville: At Browns Valley Rd and Waterford/Clarecastle Way, and Marshall Rd and Southside Bikeway: H9-04-036 Implement ped crossing enhancements, advanced ped warning signs, Rectangular Rapid Flashing Beacons (RRFBs), high visibility crosswalk striping	Safety - Safety improvement program



METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION

Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
TEL 415.778.6700  
WEB [www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov)

## *Memorandum*

TO: Air Quality Conformity Task Force

DATE: March 28, 2019

FR: Adam Crenshaw

RE: Review of the Regional Conformity Status for New Projects

Staff has prepared the following information in an effort to streamline the review of the regional air quality conformity implications of projects that staff proposes to add into the 2019 TIP through current or future revisions. This item is for advisory purposes only. The inclusion of these projects and project changes in a proposed revision to the TIP is subject to Commission approval in the case of amendments and MTC's Executive Director or Deputy Executive Director in the case of administrative modifications. The final determination of the regional air quality conformity status of these projects will be made by the Federal Highway Administration, the Federal Transit Administration and the Environmental Protection Agency as part of their review of proposed final TIP amendments and by the Executive Director or Deputy Executive Director as part of their review for TIP administrative modifications.

### Projects Staff is Proposing to Include in the 2019 TIP

Staff has received requests from sponsors to add six new group listed project to the 2019 TIP. Attachment A includes a list of these projects along with the regional air quality category that staff believes best describes the projects.

MTC staff is not seeking a determination on the status of these projects for project-level conformity purposes with this item.

**Item 4 - Attachment A**

County	TIP ID/FMS ID	Sponsor	Project Name	Project Description	Project Expanded Description	Project Type	
<b>Proposed New Group Listed Projects for Regional Air Quality Conformity Status Review</b>							
1	Alameda	VAR170007	Caltrans	GL: Safety Improvements - SHOPP Collision Reduction	In and near the cities of Alameda, Emeryville, Berkeley, Albany, and San Leandro on Routes 61, 123, and 185 at various locations. Install vehicle speed feedback signs and upgrade signal to standard.	In and near the cities of Alameda, Emeryville, Berkeley, Albany, and San Leandro on Routes 61, 123, and 185 at various locations. Install vehicle speed feedback signs and upgrade signal to standard.	EXEMPT (40 CFR 93.126) - Traffic control devices and operating assistance other than signalization projects
2	Alameda	VAR170007	Caltrans	GL: Safety Improvements - SHOPP Collision Reduction	Near Woodside, from the Santa Clara County line to Route 84 (PM 2.121/10.518). Install curve warning signs, enhanced visibility striping, pavement markings with audible traffic stripe systems, and optical speed bars.	Near Woodside, from the Santa Clara County line to Route 84 (PM 2.121/10.518). Install curve warning signs, enhanced visibility striping, pavement markings with audible traffic stripe systems, and optical speed bars.	EXEMPT (40 CFR 93.126) - Projects that correct, improve, or eliminate a hazardous location or feature
3	Santa Clara	VAR170008	Caltrans	GL: Emergency Repair - SHOPP Emergency Response	Near Los Gatos, at Blossom Hill Road Overcrossing Bridge No. 37-0148. High load bridge hit repair.	Near Los Gatos, at Blossom Hill Road Overcrossing Bridge No. 37-0148. High load bridge hit repair.	EXEMPT (40 CFR 93.126) - Projects that correct, improve, or eliminate a hazardous location or feature
4	Sonoma	VAR170008	Caltrans	GL: Emergency Repair - SHOPP Emergency Response	Near Jenner, at 1.1 miles east of Route 1. Construct sheet pile retaining wall and place rock slope protection.	Near Jenner, at 1.1 miles east of Route 1. Construct sheet pile retaining wall and place rock slope protection.	EXEMPT (40 CFR 93.126) - Projects that correct, improve, or eliminate a hazardous location or feature
5	Sonoma	VAR170008	Caltrans	GL: Emergency Repair - SHOPP Emergency Response	Near Healdsburg, from south of Lytton Springs Road to South Geyserville Avenue. Rehabilitate or replace damaged drainage systems at two locations.	Near Healdsburg, from south of Lytton Springs Road to South Geyserville Avenue. Rehabilitate or replace damaged drainage systems at two locations.	EXEMPT (40 CFR 93.126) - Projects that correct, improve, or eliminate a hazardous location or feature
6	Sonoma	VAR170008	Caltrans	GL: Emergency Repair - SHOPP Emergency Response	Near Cloverdale, at 0.4 mile south of the Mendocino County line. Restore slope, rebuild damaged gutter and install erosion control measures.	Near Cloverdale, at 0.4 mile south of the Mendocino County line. Restore slope, rebuild damaged gutter and install erosion control measures.	EXEMPT (40 CFR 93.126) - Projects that correct, improve, or eliminate a hazardous location or feature



METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION

Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
TEL 415.778.6700  
WEB [www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov)

## *Memorandum*

TO: Air Quality Conformity Task Force

DATE: March 15, 2019

FR: Harold Brazil

W. I.

RE: Conformity Redetermination for the 2019 Transportation Improvement Program and Amended Plan Bay Area 2040

### **Background**

Transportation conformity is required under CAA section 176(c) (42 U.S.C. 7506(c)) to ensure that federally funded or approved highway and transit activities are consistent with (“conform to”) the purpose of the state air quality implementation plan (SIP). Conformity to the purpose of the SIP means that transportation activities will not cause or contribute to new air quality violations, worsen existing violations, or delay timely attainment of the relevant National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS) or any interim milestones. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)’s transportation conformity rule (40 CFR Parts 51 and 93) establishes the criteria and procedures for determining whether metropolitan transportation plans, TIPs, and federally supported highway and transit projects conform to the SIP. Transportation conformity applies to designated nonattainment and maintenance areas<sup>1</sup> for transportation-related criteria pollutants: ozone, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub>, carbon monoxide, and nitrogen dioxide.<sup>2</sup>

On Oct. 1, 2015, EPA strengthened the NAAQS for ground-level ozone to 70 parts per billion (ppb), based on extensive scientific evidence about ozone’s effects on public health and welfare. Subsequently, on June 4, 2018, EPA published a final rule that designated 51 areas as nonattainment for the 2015 ozone NAAQS (83 FR 25776). These designations are effective 60 days after the Federal Register publication, i.e. August 3, 2018. This means that conformity of transportation plans and transportation improvement programs (TIPs) for the 2015 ozone NAAQS must be demonstrated in these nonattainment areas by the end of the grace period, which is **August 3, 2019**. After that date, project-level conformity will also apply in these areas for the 2015 ozone NAAQS.

The San Francisco Bay Area region is designated by EPA as being in nonattainment for the 2015 ozone NAAQS and must show compliance with these new requirements by the August 3, 2019 deadline. Compliance will be completed through the transportation conformity process, which conforms the most recent Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) – currently the Amended Plan Bay Area 2040 – and Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) – currently the MTC’s 2019 TIP to the State Implementation Plan (SIP).

---

<sup>1</sup> “Maintenance areas” are those areas that were initially designated nonattainment for a criteria pollutant and subsequently redesignated to attainment after 1990. Maintenance areas have SIPs developed under CAA section 175A.

<sup>2</sup> See “Transportation Conformity Guidance for 2008 Ozone Nonattainment Areas”; <https://www3.epa.gov/otaq/stateresources/transconf/regs/420b12045.pdf>.

The transportation conformity rule designated by EPA allows for the reliance on the previous regional emissions analysis for conformity redeterminations. To ensure that MTC will be in compliance with the 2015 ozone NAAQS by August 3, 2019, and to ensure that any delays to the Amended Plan Bay Area 2040 schedule do not put the region at risk of a lapse in conformity, MTC will be preparing a conformity redetermination using the latest conformity analysis for the 2019 TIP and Amended Plan Bay Area 2040.

Note: On February 16, 2018, the District of Columbia Circuit Court of Appeals issued a decision in *South Coast Air Quality Management District v. EPA et al*, in which parties challenged different aspects of EPA's SIP Requirements Rule for the 2008 Ozone NAAQS, including the revocation of the 1997 ozone NAAQS. The decision does not address or mention the 2015 ozone NAAQS; transportation conformity applies for the 2015 ozone NAAQS according to statute and existing regulations.

### **Carbon Monoxide (CO) Requirements**

The approved 1998 maintenance plan for the San Francisco-Oakland-San Jose Carbon Monoxide nonattainment area did not extend the maintenance plan period beyond 20 years from re-designation. Consequently, transportation conformity requirements for CO ceased to apply after June 1, 2018 (i.e., 20 years after the effective date of the EPA's approval of the first 10-year maintenance plan and redesignation of the area to attainment for CO NAAQS). As a result, as of June 1, 2018 – transportation conformity requirements no longer apply for the CO NAAQS in the San Francisco-Oakland-San Jose CO nonattainment area for Federal Highway Administration/Federal Transit Association projects as defined in 40 CFR 93.101.

### **PM<sub>2.5</sub> Requirements**

The Bay Area's designation as nonattainment was published in the Federal Register on November 13, 2009 and the designation became effective on December 14, 2009. Nonattainment areas were required to meet the standard by 2014 and transportation conformity requirements began to apply to the Bay Area on December 14, 2010.

On February 8, 2013, EPA took final action and determined that the San Francisco Bay Area nonattainment area attained the 2006 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> NAAQS. This determination was based upon complete, quality-assured, and certified ambient air monitoring data showing that this area has monitored attainment of the 2006 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> NAAQS based on the 2009–2011 monitoring period. Based on the above determination, the requirements for the San Francisco Bay Area nonattainment area to submit an attainment demonstration (including transportation conformity emission budgets), together with reasonably available control measures (RACM), a reasonable further progress (RFP) plan, and contingency measures for failure to meet RFP and attainment deadlines were suspended for as long as the Bay Area continues to attain the 2006 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> NAAQS.

Therefore, since approved motor vehicle emissions budgets for PM<sub>2.5</sub> are not available for use in this conformity analysis, MTC must complete one of the two interim emissions tests:

1. “Baseline Year Test”. Emissions for each analysis year for the “Action” are less than or equal to the level of emissions in the year 2008<sup>3</sup>; or
2. “Build/No-Build Test”. Emissions for each analysis year in the “Action” scenario are less than or equal to emissions from the “Baseline” scenario.

---

<sup>3</sup> See 40 CFR 93.119; <https://www.epa.gov/state-and-local-transportation/baseline-year-baseline-year-test-40-cfr-93119>

## Analysis Approach

MTC will review the proposed conformity approach at the March 28<sup>th</sup> Conformity Task Force meeting. MTC will review the approach with the Conformity Task Force again when we present the draft conformity analysis in April 2019. Key aspects of the conformity analysis are as follows:

1. Regional Emissions Analysis: MTC will conduct a new regional emissions analysis to conform the draft 2019 TIP and the Amended PBA2040.
2. Latest Planning Assumptions: MTC will use the latest planning assumptions, including:
  - **UrbanSim**; regional land use forecasting model – **UrbanSim** relies on regional control totals of jobs, housing, and population, developed and adopted by ABAG, to analyze the effects of land use and transportation strategies on the forecasted regional development pattern. **UrbanSim** simulates the interactions of households, businesses, developers, and governments within the urban market. **UrbanSim** produces land use outputs, including the forecasted location of new jobs and housing for a forecasted scenario. MTC and ABAG staff have evaluated the model outputs through an extensive planning process which involved input by local jurisdictions.
  - **Travel Model One**; Updated travel demand forecasts using MTC’s **Travel Model One** (version 0.6), released July 2016, was validated against the years 2000, 2005 and 2010 observed conditions with the most up to date highway and transit networks.
  - **EMFAC2014**; VMT estimates used in the federally approved **EMFAC2014** emission model will be consistent with the California Air Resources Board’s (CARB) recommended adjustment methods.
3. Latest Emissions Model: MTC will apply EMFAC2014 model system to produce emission estimates.
4. Emissions Budget/Interim Emissions:
  - **Ozone**: MTC will use the 1-hour motor vehicle emissions budget from the *2001 Ozone Attainment Plan* as the 8-hour motor vehicle emissions budget to demonstrate conformity with the 8-hour ozone standard. The ozone budget for ROG and NOx was compared to quantified emissions for analysis years **2020, 2030 and 2040**. EPA designated<sup>4</sup> the San Francisco Bay Area as “Marginal” for nonattainment of the 2015 ozone standard with the applicable modeling attainment date/year of **2020**. CFR 93.118(d)(2) requires the regional emissions analysis to be performed for the attainment year for the 2015 ozone NAAQS, if it is within the timeframe of the transportation plan and conformity determination – therefore, the **2021** year will be included in this conformity analysis.
  - **Carbon Monoxide (CO)**: N/A
  - **PM<sub>2.5</sub>**: MTC will use the “Baseline Year Test” interim emission test to demonstrate conformity with the 24-hour PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard. Consistent with EPA’s

---

<sup>4</sup> See Nonattainment and Unclassifiable Area Designations for the 2015 Ozone Standards -- April 30, 2018; [https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2018-04/documents/placeholder\\_1.pdf](https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2018-04/documents/placeholder_1.pdf)

Transportation Conformity Rule PM<sub>2.5</sub> and PM<sub>10</sub> Amendments; Final Rule published in the federal register in March 2010. MTC will quantify emissions for both directly emitted PM<sub>2.5</sub> and NO<sub>x</sub> (as the precursor to PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions) and for the baseline year test, emissions from the planned transportation system are compared to emissions that occurred in the baseline year for analysis years **2020, 2030 and 2040**. The analysis will be carried out using inputs for the winter season, during which the Bay Area experiences its highest levels of PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. MTC will present documentation regarding the projects proposed for inclusion in the Build scenarios.

5. Transportation Control Measure (TCM) Implementation: The motor vehicle emissions estimates for ROG and NO<sub>x</sub> will include the effects of TCMs A-E in the 2001 Ozone Attainment Plan. These TCMs are now fully implemented.
6. Financial Constraint: The TIP must be financially constrained by year, meaning that the amount of dollars committed to the projects (also referred as “programmed”) must not exceed the amount of dollars estimated to be available. The Draft Amended 2019 TIP will include the fiscal constraint analysis. The Amended PBA2040’s draft Investment Strategy comprises a 24-year fiscally constrained set of transportation projects and programs that support the region’s land use and transportation goals. The original Plan Bay Area 2040’s total plan investment totals \$310 billion in year of expenditure (YOE) dollars. Of this total, roughly \$74 billion is considered to be discretionary revenue.
7. Interagency and Public Consultation: MTC will conduct the appropriate agency and public consultation for the Draft Transportation Air Quality Conformity Analysis for the Draft Amended 2019 TIP and Amended PBA2040.

**Attachment A: Draft Schedule for the Transportation Air Quality Conformity Analysis for Draft Amended 2019 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) and Amended Plan Bay Area 2040 (PBA2040)**

<b>Activity</b>	<b>Timeline</b>
Conformity Task Force Reviews Proposed Conformity Approach	March 28, 2019
MTC Staff Conducts Technical Analysis & Report Preparation	March/April 2019
Begin Public Review and Comment Period	March 29, 2019
Discuss Draft Conformity Analysis with AQCTF	April 25, 2019
End of Public Comment Period	April 30, 2019
Committee Approval	May 10, 2019
Commission Approval	May 22, 2019
AQCTF Briefing on Responses to Comments	May 23, 2019
Expected FHWA/FTA Final Approval of the Amended 2019 TIP and Amended PBA2040 AQ Conformity Analysis	June/July, 2019

**Air Quality Conformity Task Force  
Summary Meeting Notes  
February 28, 2019**

Participants:

Lynn McIntyre – AECOM

Rodney Tavitas – Caltrans

Dominique Kraft – FTA

Ginger Vagenas – EPA

Panah Stauffer – EPA

Lucas Sanchez – Caltrans

Adam Crenshaw – MTC

Harold Brazil – MTC

**1. Welcome and Self Introductions:** Harold Brazil (MTC) called the meeting to order at 9:35 am.

**2. PM<sub>2.5</sub> Project Conformity Interagency Consultations**

**a. Consultation to Determine Project of Air Quality Concern Status**

**i. I-680 Express Lanes from SR 84 to Alcosta Boulevard Project**

Lynn McIntyre (AECOM) started her presentation of the I-680 Express Lanes from SR 84 to Alcosta Boulevard project by stating that the project would construct new HOV/express lanes in median of northbound and southbound I-680 from SR 84 (Vallecitos Road) to north of Alcosta Boulevard. Ms. McIntyre also indicated that the project would:

- Install electronic tolling equipment and signage
- Widen median pavement and bridge structures, and
- Construct retaining walls and sound walls

Ms. McIntyre went on to describe the purpose and need of the I-680 Express Lanes from SR 84 to Alcosta Boulevard project by stating that the project would:

- Increase the efficiency of the transportation system
- Improve travel time reliability for all users
- Optimize freeway system management and traffic operations
- Maintain consistency with legislation to implement an HOV/express lanes system in Alameda County
- Close the 9-mile gap between existing or in-construction HOV/express lane segments to the south and north

Ms. McIntyre discussed that although the project would add an HOV/express lane to each direction to I-680 within the project limits, the majority of diesel trucks are restricted from using either HOV or express lanes and (subsequently) the project would not add capacity for diesel vehicles on I-680. In addition, Ms. McIntyre stated trucks would comprise 4 percent of annual average daily traffic with and without the project and, therefore, the project would not result in a significant increase in the number of diesel vehicles. By providing HOV/express lanes, the project would improve congestion and reduce idling in the general purpose lanes that the trucks use. The project would not be considered a Project of Air Quality Concern under this criterion.

Panah Stauffer (EPA) asked about the significant increases in year 2045 lane densities for segments on Vargas Road and Paloma Way between the no project and project alternatives of the I-680 Express Lanes from SR 84 to Alcosta Boulevard project. Ms. McIntyre explained that the no project alternative produces a 5 hour long bottle-neck situation north of the I-680/Sunol Boulevard exit ramp. In the project alternative, Ms. McIntyre stated that in the year 2045 analysis, the bottle-neck at Sunol Boulevard is removed, but a smaller (2 hour long) bottle-neck is created on I-680 at Paloma Way. Ms. McIntyre went on to say that the project alternative delivers high SB I-680 traffic volumes sooner to the Niles Canyon, thereby generating the bottle-neck at Paloma Way.

**Final Determination:** With input from FHWA, EPA, Caltrans (deferring their determination to FHWA) and FTA, the Task Force concluded that the I-680 Express Lanes from SR 84 to Alcosta Boulevard project was not of air quality concern.

### **b. Confirm Projects Are Exempt from PM<sub>2.5</sub> Conformity**

#### **i. Arroyo de Laguna Bridge Scour project (Discussion)**

Harold Brazil (MTC) followed up with the Task Force on the GL: Bridge Rehab and Reconstruction – SHOPP/Arroyo de Laguna Bridge Scour project, indicating that one of the project options includes a turn lane leading to a stop sign controlled intersection. Mr. Brazil asked the Task Force members if the Arroyo de Laguna Bridge Scour project should be considered an intersection channelization project and whether the project sponsor should be requested to come in for consultation.

**Final Determination:** With input from FHWA, EPA, Caltrans and FTA, the Task Force concluded that GL: Bridge Rehab and Reconstruction – SHOPP/Arroyo de Laguna Bridge Scour project was not of air quality concern.

#### **ii. Confirmation of the list of exempt projects from PM<sub>2.5</sub> conformity (2b\_Exempt List 021419.pdf)**

Dominique Kraft (FTA) asked if SFMTA's Woods Bus Facility Modernization project (TIPID# SF-190001) would be constructed on the footprint of the existing facility. Adam Crenshaw (MTC) followed up with SFMTA who indicated that all of the work for the Woods Bus Facility Modernization project will take place within the existing footprint of the facility.

**Final Determination:** With input from FTA, EPA, Caltrans and FHWA, the Task Force agreed that the project on the exempt list (**2b\_Exempt List 021419.pdf**) was exempt from

### **3. Projects with Regional Air Quality Conformity Concerns**

#### **a. Review of the Regional Conformity Status for New and Revised Projects**

##### Projects Staff Proposing to Include in the 2019 TIP

Adam Crenshaw (MTC) stated that MTC staff had received requests from sponsors to add one new individually listed project to the 2019 TIP. Panah Stauffer (EPA) asked for clarification on the action taking place with the Vallejo - Sacramento St Streetscape project being amended to the

2019 TIP and Mr. Crenshaw responded by indicating the information provided is for transparency purposes for MTC's TIP revision process. Lucas Sanchez (Caltrans) commended Mr. Crenshaw on his proactivity in presenting this agenda item to the group and also noted MTC for being the only MPO in the state who conducts this type of process.

#### **4. Consent Calendar**

##### **a. February 28, 2019 Air Quality Conformity Task Force Meeting Summary**

***Final Determination:*** With input from all members, the Task Force concluded that the consent calendar was approved.

#### **5. Other Items**

- Harold Brazil (MTC) mentioned MTC will be generating a conformity determination for the new 2015 ozone NAAQS.
- Rodney Tavitas (Caltrans) stated that any California MPO needing to determine conformity under the 2015 ozone NAAQS, Caltrans recommends that the regional conformity analysis be done as soon as possible due to the proposed Safe Affordable Fuel-Efficient (SAFE) Vehicle rule revising the Corporate Average Fuel Economy (CAFE) and California mobile-source emissions standards and regulations.
- Mr. Tavitas also mentioned the NTI transportation conformity course hosted by Caltrans division 4 in Oakland, March 25-27 and asked if Harold Brazil (MTC) would be willing to participate in a round table discussion on the 27<sup>th</sup>. Mr. Brazil agreed to attend.